

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
The Honorable Marsha J. Pechman  
8  
9

10  
11  
12  
**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE**  
13  
14

RYAN KARNOSKI, et al.,  
15

No. 2:17-cv-1297-MJP  
16

Plaintiffs,  
17

**JOINT STIPULATION TO UNSEAL  
SELVA MOTION TO QUASH AND  
CONSOLIDATE CASES FOR ALL  
PURPOSES**  
18

v.  
19

DONALD J. TRUMP, et al.,  
20

Defendants.  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 Plaintiffs Ryan Karnoski, Staff Sergeant Cathrine Schmid, D.L., Chief Warrant Officer  
 2 Lindsey Muller, Petty Officer First Class Terece Lewis, Petty Officer Second Class Phillip  
 3 Stephens, Petty Officer Second Class Megan Winters, Jane Doe, Human Rights Campaign,  
 4 Gender Justice League, and American Military Partners Association n/k/a Modern Military  
 5 Association of America (collectively “Plaintiffs”), Plaintiff-Intervenor State of Washington,  
 6 and Defendants Donald J. Trump, Mark Esper, and the United States Department of Defense  
 7 (collectively “Defendants,” and together with Plaintiffs and Plaintiff-Intervenor, “Parties”)  
 8 hereby stipulate as follows:

9 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs served Federal Rule of Civil Procedure (“FRCP”) 45 subpoenas  
 10 for the depositions of former Secretary of Defense James N. Mattis, former Vice Chairman of  
 11 the Joint Chiefs of Staff General Paul J. Selva, and current Secretary of Veterans Affairs Robert  
 12 Wilkie Jr., and former Vice Chief of Naval Operations Admiral William F. Moran;

13 WHEREAS, Defendants moved to quash all four subpoenas in the place of compliance,  
 14 *see Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*, No. 2:20-mc-00010-RAJ-RJK (E.D. Va.) (Mattis);  
 15 *Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*, No. 1:20-mc-0015-LO-TCP (E.D. Va.) (Selva); *Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*, No. 1:20-mc-00016-LO-IDD (E.D. Va.) (Wilkie); *Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*, No. 1:20-mc-00013-UA-JEP (M.D.N.C.) (Moran);

16 WHEREAS, at Plaintiffs’ Request, and over Defendants’ objections, the courts in the  
 17 Mattis, Selva and Wilkie matters transferred those subpoena disputes to this district.<sup>1</sup> *See Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*, No. 2:20-mc-00061-MJP (W.D. Wa.) (Mattis); *Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*, No. 2:20-mc-00055-MJP (W.D. Wa.) (Selva); *Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*, No. 2:20-mc-00056-MJP (W.D. Wa.) (Wilkie);

18 WHEREAS, the Selva matter has been sealed in its entirety despite no order from the  
 19 transferor court requiring such relief;

---

20  
 21  
 22  
 23  
 24  
 25  
 26  
 27  
 28

<sup>1</sup> Plaintiffs’ motion to transfer the Moran matter is still pending in the Middle District of North Carolina, as is Defendants’ motion to quash the Moran subpoena. *See Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*, No. 1:20-mc-00013-UA-JEP (M.D.N.C.)

1        WHEREAS, on July 23, 2020, with Plaintiff and Plaintiff-Intervenor's consent, counsel  
 2 for Defendants contacted the Clerk's Office to request that the Selva matter be unsealed;

3        WHEREAS, on July 24, 2020, the Law Clerk to the Hon. Marsha J. Pechman contacted  
 4 the Parties via email, and stated that the Clerk's Office requests that, if the parties agree that the  
 5 Selva matter was sealed in error, the parties "file a stipulated motion to unseal;"

6        WHEREAS, this Court previously consolidated a third-party subpoena matter that had  
 7 been transferred to this district with the underlying case, *see* Dkt. 367 (consolidating transferred  
 8 matter concerning Dr. Paul R. McHugh);

9        WHEREAS, the Parties, in accordance with Local Civil Rule ("LCR") 42(b), met and  
 10 agreed that the Mattis, Selva, and Wilkie subpoena disputes should be consolidated with the  
 11 underlying case, and further agreed that this would not require additional changes to the case  
 12 schedule, *see* Dkt. 550;

13        NOW THEREFORE, the Parties, through their respective counsel of record, do hereby  
 14 stipulate and agree as follows:

- 15        • No. 2:20-mc-00055-MJP, concerning the motion to quash the deposition of  
             former Vice Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff General Paul J. Selva, should  
             be unsealed, however, individual documents that previously were placed under  
             seal by the transferor court should remain under seal;
- 16        • No. 2:20-mc-00061-MJP, No. 2:20-mc-00055-MJP, and No. 2:20-mc-00056-  
             MJP, concerning the motions to quash the depositions of former Secretary of  
             Defense James N. Mattis, former Vice Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff  
             General Paul J. Selva, and current Secretary of Veterans Affairs Robert Wilkie  
             Jr., respectively, should be consolidated with the underlying case, No. 2:17-cv-  
             1297-MJP, for all purposes pursuant to FRCP 42 and LCR 42.<sup>2</sup>

27        <sup>2</sup> Despite agreeing to consolidation, Defendants respectfully maintain their  
 28 disagreement with the transfers of the Mattis, Selva, and Wilkie matters to this district, and  
 maintain that each motion to quash requires a distinct apex analysis.

1 SO STIPULATED.  
2  
3

Respectfully submitted, July 30, 2020.

4 **NEWMAN DU WORS LLP**

5  
6 *s/Rachel Horvitz*

7 Derek A. Newman, WSBA No. 26967  
dn@newmanlaw.com  
8 Jason B. Sykes, WSBA No. 44369  
jason@newmanlaw.com  
9 Rachel Horvitz, WSBA No. 52987  
rachel@newmanlaw.com  
10 2101 Fourth Ave., Ste. 1500  
Seattle, WA 98121  
11 (206) 274-2800

12 **LAMDBA LEGAL DEFENSE AND  
EDUCATION FUND, INC.**

13 Tara Borelli, WSBA No. 36759  
tborelli@lambdalegal.org  
14 Camilla B. Taylor (admitted pro hac vice)  
Peter C. Renn (admitted pro hac vice)  
Sasha Buchert (admitted pro hac vice)  
Kara Ingelhart (admitted pro hac vice)  
Carl Charles (admitted pro hac vice)  
Paul D. Castillo (admitted pro hac vice)

15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20 **OUTSERVE-SLDN, INC. N/K/A  
MODERN MILITARY ASSOCIATION  
OF AMERICA**

21 Peter Perkowski (admitted pro hac vice)

22  
23 **KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**

24 James F. Hurst, P.C. (admitted pro hac vice)  
Steve Patton (admitted pro hac vice)

25  
26  
27  
28 **UNITED STATES  
DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE**

DAVID M. MORRELL  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

ALEXANDER K. HAAS  
Branch Director

ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
Deputy Director

*s/ Matthew Skurnik*  
MATTHEW SKURNIK, NY Bar # 5553896  
Matthew.Skurnik@usdoj.gov  
JAMES R. POWERS, TX Bar #24092989  
james.r.powers@usdoj.gov  
Trial Attorneys  
ANDREW E. CARMICHAEL, VA Bar #  
76578  
andrew.e.carmichael@usdoj.gov  
Senior Trial Counsel  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
1100 L Street NW, Suite 12108  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 616-8188

*Counsel for Defendants*  
**OFFICE OF THE WASHINGTON  
STATE ATTORNEY GENERAL**

*s/ Chalia I. Stallings-Ala'ili*

1           Jordan M. Heinz (admitted pro hac vice)  
2           Vanessa Barsanti (admitted pro hac vice)  
3           Daniel I. Siegfried (admitted pro hac vice)

4           *Counsel for Plaintiffs*

5           Colleen M. Melody, WSBA No. 42275  
6           *colleenm1@atg.wa.gov*  
7           Chalia I. Stallings-Ala’ilima, WSBA No.  
8           40694  
9           *chalias@atg.wa.gov*  
10          Assistant Attorneys General  
11          Civil Rights Unit  
12          Attorney General’s Office  
13          800 5th Ave, Suite 2000  
14          Seattle, WA 98104  
15          (206) 464-7744

16          Counsel for Plaintiff-Intervenor State of  
17          Washington

## ORDER

This matter comes before the Court on the Parties' Joint Stipulation To Unseal Selva Motion To Quash And Consolidate Cases For All Purposes. After considering the Parties' Joint Stipulation, the Court hereby ORDERS the following:

- No. 2:20-mc-00055-MJP, concerning the motion to quash the deposition of former Vice Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff General Paul J. Selva, is hereby unsealed, however, individual documents that previously were placed under seal by the transferor court shall remain under seal;
  - No. 2:20-mc-00061-MJP, No. 2:20-mc-00055-MJP, and No. 2:20-mc-00056-MJP, concerning the motions to quash the depositions of former Secretary of Defense James N. Mattis, former Vice Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff General Paul J. Selva, and current Secretary of Veterans Affairs Robert Wilkie Jr., respectively, shall be consolidated with the underlying case, No. 2:17-cv-1297-MJP, for all purposes pursuant to FRCP 42 and LCR 42.

**All future filings shall be filed in 17-cv-1297 MJP.**

IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED this 30th day of July, 2020.

Wesley P. Releman

**Marsha J. Pechman**  
**United States Senior District Judge**

1 Presented By:  
2 **NEWMAN DU WORS LLP**  
3

4 *s/ Rachel Horvitz*  
5

6 Derek A. Newman, WSBA No. 26967  
7 *dn@newmanlaw.com*  
8 Jason B. Sykes, WSBA No. 44369  
9 *jason@newmanlaw.com*  
10 Rachel Horvitz, WSBA No. 52987  
11 *rachel@newmanlaw.com*  
12 2101 Fourth Ave., Ste. 1500  
13 Seattle, WA 98121  
14 (206) 274-2800

15 **LAMDBA LEGAL DEFENSE AND  
16 EDUCATION FUND, INC.**

17 Tara Borelli, WSBA No. 36759  
18 *tborelli@lambdalegal.org*  
19 Camilla B. Taylor (admitted pro hac vice)  
20 Peter C. Renn (admitted pro hac vice)  
21 Sasha Buchert (admitted pro hac vice)  
22 Kara Ingelhart (admitted pro hac vice)  
23 Carl Charles (admitted pro hac vice)  
24 Paul D. Castillo (admitted pro hac vice)

25 **OUTSERVE-SLDN, INC. N/K/A  
26 MODERN MILITARY ASSOCIATION  
27 OF AMERICA**

28 Peter Perkowski (admitted pro hac vice)

29 **KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**

30 James F. Hurst, P.C. (admitted pro hac vice)  
31 Steve Patton (admitted pro hac vice)  
32 Jordan M. Heinz (admitted pro hac vice)  
33 Vanessa Barsanti (admitted pro hac vice)  
34 Daniel I. Siegfried (admitted pro hac vice)

35 *Counsel for Plaintiffs*

36  
37 UNITED STATES  
38 DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

39 DAVID M. MORRELL  
40 Deputy Assistant Attorney General

41 ALEXANDER K. HAAS  
42 Branch Director

43 ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
44 Deputy Director

45 *s/ Matthew Skurnik*

46 MATTHEW SKURNIK, NY Bar # 5553896  
47 *Matthew.Skurnik@usdoj.gov*  
48 JAMES R. POWERS, TX Bar #24092989  
49 *james.r.powers@usdoj.gov*  
50 Trial Attorneys  
51 ANDREW E. CARMICHAEL, VA Bar #  
52 76578  
53 *andrew.e.carmichael@usdoj.gov*  
54 Senior Trial Counsel  
55 United States Department of Justice  
56 Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
57 1100 L Street NW, Suite 12108  
58 Washington, DC 20530  
59 (202) 616-8188

60 *Counsel for Defendants*  
61 **OFFICE OF THE WASHINGTON  
62 STATE ATTORNEY GENERAL**

63 *s/ Chalia I. Stallings-Ala’ilima*  
64 Colleen M. Melody, WSBA No. 42275  
65 *colleenm1@atg.wa.gov*  
66 Chalia I. Stallings-Ala’ilima, WSBA No.  
67 40694  
68 *chalias@atg.wa.gov*  
69 Assistant Attorneys General  
70 Civil Rights Unit  
71 Attorney General’s Office  
72 800 5th Ave, Suite 2000  
73 Seattle, WA 98104

1 (206) 464-7744  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Counsel for Plaintiff-Intervenor State of Washington